



Earth Negotiations Bulletin

A Reporting Service for Environment and Development Negotiations

Vol. 5 No. 40 Published by the International Institute for Sustainable Development (IISD) Thursday, 27 April 1995

CSD HIGHLIGHTS WEDNESDAY, 26 APRIL 1995

PLENARY

The Chairs of the three drafting groups reported on their work and some of the draft decisions were adopted *ad referendum*.

The Chair of Drafting Group B, Takao Shibata gave his report.

Decisions on Major Groups, Information for Decision-Making, Integrating Environment and Development in Decision-Making, and Information Provided by Governments and Organizations were adopted. **Transfer of Environmentally Sound Technology, Cooperation and Capacity Building:** In paragraph 12 (finance), references to new and additional financial resources and to the flow of financial resources from all sources remain bracketed. **Science for Sustainable Development:** Sub-paragraph 10(3) (finance) remains unresolved.

The Chair of Drafting Group A, Magnús Jóhannesson, then reported on the work of his group. The decision on Demographic Dynamics and Sustainability was adopted without amendment. **Combating Poverty:** In paragraph 4 (integrated approach), Indonesia questioned the reference to "women, as the majority of people living in poverty." After some discussion, the formulation "women, as the majority of people living in abject poverty, and who bear a disproportionate burden of poverty" was accepted. The text was adopted as amended. **Financial Resources and Mechanisms:** It was agreed to move paragraph 22 (indigenous and farmers' rights) to the decision on biodiversity. In paragraph 26 (financing of biotechnology), brackets were removed and a reference to consultations among governments was added. The text was adopted as amended. **Changing Production and Consumption Patterns:** In paragraph 7 (role of governments), the second bracketed option was accepted and a reference to the exchange of information and experiences was added. In paragraph 16 (work programmes), brackets remain around a reference to expert meetings. **Trade, Environment and Sustainable Development:** In paragraph 6 (multilateral environmental agreements), all bracketed text was deleted. Bracketed references to the OECD in paragraphs 16 (international organizations) and 17 (eco-labeling and recycling) were deleted. Paragraph 20 *bis*, which refers to the OECD, was added. In paragraph 21, brackets were removed and references to exchange of experience and making trade and environment mutually supportive were added. By mid-day, brackets still remained around a reference to sustainable development in paragraph 3 (Uruguay Round).

In his report on Drafting Group C, Henry Aryamanya-Mugisha noted that the text on forests contains many bracketed paragraphs

and negotiations were still on-going. The text on Combating Desertification was adopted. **Overall Considerations:** In paragraph 3 (national efforts), the EU specified Chapter 33 of Agenda 21 in a call for implementation of financial decisions. **Integrated Approach to Land Resources:** Brackets in paragraph 10 (time-frame) and paragraph 13(e) (ESTs) were removed. Brackets in paragraph 13(c) (cities and rural areas) remain. **Sustainable Mountain Development:** In paragraph 38 (marginalization), brackets remain around [protection] of indigenous people's interests.

HIGH-LEVEL SEGMENT

CSD Chair **Henrique Cavalcanti** noted the topics for consideration: financial resources and mechanisms, transfer of environmentally sound technology and capacity building; consumption and production patterns; sustainable agriculture, rural development and food security; forests; and major groups. He also requested guidance on the CSD work programme for 1995-96.

Nitin Desai, Under-Secretary-General for Policy Coordination and Sustainable Development, reviewed the role and impact of the CSD in catalyzing cross-sectoral policy actions. He also noted the impact of the CSD on the work of the UN system. Funding, regional and global-level implementation, and cooperation with external entities must be addressed.

DENMARK: Poul Nielson, Minister for Development, described how the World Summit on Social Development (WSSD) affirmed commitments made in Rio. Denmark advocates: statistical benchmarks to monitor Summit progress; dynamic targets; independent financial resources for the UN system; and follow-up by an independent commission.

PHILIPPINES: Cielito F. Habito, Secretary of Socio-Economic Planning, said the Philippines has entered into debt-for-nature swaps with WWF and Switzerland, and will be sponsoring: an Experts Meeting on Persistent Organic Pollutants, a meeting of sustainable development councils in Asia, and a conference on population, environment and peace.

FRANCE: Michel Barnier, Minister of the Environment, on behalf of the EU, said the EU devoted nearly US\$30 billion to ODA in 1993. The UN objective of 0.7% of GNP for ODA remains a valid commitment. Such assistance should be increasingly concentrated on the poorest countries, particularly in Africa.

INDONESIA: Djamaludin Suryohadikusumo, Minister for Forestry, recommended: criteria and indicators for sustainable forest management; further dialogue on trade in forest products and voluntary certification schemes; strengthened international cooperation and mobilization of financial resources; and implementation of existing forestry-related instruments.

This issue of the *Earth Negotiations Bulletin* © <enb@econet.apc.org> is written and edited by Johannah Bernstein, Pamela Chasek <pchasek@pipeline.com>, Peter Doran <foeireland@toppsi.gn.apc.org> and Virginia Hulme. The managing editor is Langston James Goree VI "Kimo" <kimo@pipeline.com>. The sustaining donors of the *Bulletin* are the International Institute for Sustainable Development <iisd@web.apc.org>, the United Nations Environment Programme and the Pew Charitable Trusts through the Pew Global Stewardship Initiative. General support for the *Bulletin* for 1995 is provided by the United Kingdom, Switzerland, Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit and the World Bank. The authors can be contacted at their electronic mail addresses and by phone or fax at +1-212-888-2737. IISD can be contacted at 161 Portage Avenue East, 6th Floor, Winnipeg, Manitoba R3B 0Y4, Canada; tel: +1-204-958-7700; fax: +1-204-958-7710. The opinions expressed in *Earth Negotiations Bulletin* are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of IISD and other funders. Excerpts from the *Earth Negotiations Bulletin* may be used in other publications with appropriate citation. Electronic versions of the *Bulletin* can be found on the gopher at <gopher.econet.apc.org> and in searchable hypertext through the *Linkages* WWW-server at <http://www.iisd.ca/linkages/> on the Internet. This volume of the *Bulletin* is uploaded into the APC conferences <enb.library> and <un.csd.general>.

RUSSIAN FEDERATION: Danilov Danilyan, Minister for Environmental Protection and Natural Resources, welcomed progress on forests and noted a Belarus proposal for a conference on sustainable development for countries with economies in transition.

NETHERLANDS: Jan Pronk, Minister of Development Cooperation, said poverty eradication should be financed by domestic resource mobilization. Private capital flows are impressive, but are volatile and unevenly distributed. New financial mechanisms are needed.

MOROCCO: Dr. Noureddi Benomar Alami, Minister of the Environment, noted Morocco's recent efforts to: establish an Environment Ministry, a committee to combat desertification, and an environmental information system; implement the polluter-pays principle; and prepare water resources and forest plans.

REPUBLIC OF KOREA: Zoong Wie Kim, Minister of Environment, said his country has been using a Volume-Based Waste Collection Fee System to change consumption patterns and reduce waste. The Republic of Korea has offered to host an international workshop on this issue in September.

AUSTRALIA: John Faulkner, Minister for the Environment, Sport and Territories, welcomed proposals to streamline national reporting, and noted that the CSD's work on agriculture and rural development provides an opportunity to examine agricultural trade reform's contribution to sustainable development.

URUGUAY: Juan Chiruchi, Minister of Housing and Environment, noted Uruguay's advisory technical commission on the environment with the participation of government authorities and civil society. Uruguay is encouraging municipal authorities, local and regional governments to develop local Agenda 21s.

SRI LANKA: Mrs. S. Athulathmudali, Minister of Transport, Environment and Women's Affairs, noted recent initiatives such as: the Clean Air 2000 Action Plan; an Energy Conservation Fund; a forestry master plan; a coastal zone management strategy; and a phase-out of ozone depleting substances by 2004.

PANEL DISCUSSION ON EMPLOYMENT AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

The moderator, **Naresh Singh** of the International Institute for Sustainable Development, noted that poverty, employment and social integration are central to sustainable development.

Poul Nielson, Denmark's Minister for Development Cooperation, called for policies on worker health and safety, working conditions, and education and training. He also noted that green taxes may contribute to employment and environmental protection, but that political action is needed.

Igor Khalevinski, Russian Deputy Minister of Labor, noted the factors that pose problems in addressing unemployment. He referred to recent initiatives to: attract investment from Russian business; promote social sustainable development; and shift attention from economic to social programmes.

Marius Enthoven suggested: integrating economic growth and environmental protection; stimulating the green industry; focusing on environmental performance rather than productivity; reviewing unsustainable subsidies; and reforming the tax system.

Dick Martin, Secretary-Treasurer of the Canada Labor Congress, noted the possible results if all 1.5 million ICFTU workplaces implemented a local Agenda 21. He suggested environmental audits and promoting workers' environmental rights.

Clement Millin, Texaco, recommended: the adoption of key business principles to promote sustainable development and economic growth; promotion of market economies to promote investment; and the building of education infrastructure capacity.

In the discussion that followed, Paula DiPerna (Cousteau Society) noted the public's fear of job loss. Nielson responded that education is key to change. Nielsen referred to the jobs that were generated from the newly established exhaust-cleaning industry.

Simone Bilderbeek (Netherlands Committee for the IUCN) highlighted the concept of job-sharing to ensure equitable resource-sharing. Martin responded that some people are working too hard, while some are not working enough. Richard Tapper (WWF) noted that a sustainable economy is more likely to support higher employment because it increases efficiency in resource use. Carol Lubin (International Federation of Settlements and Neighborhood Centres) asked about women's under-employment. Martin said that women are usually at the bottom of the economic scale and the victims of environmental neglect.

DRAFTING GROUP C

Drafting Group C met in an informal session on Wednesday night to complete negotiations on outstanding issues.

COMBATING DEFORESTATION: The US proposed a new formulation for **paragraph 24** that supports further study on the issue of certification and labeling of forest products to contribute to a better understanding of their potential role. The Chair called for further consultations on this paragraph and paragraph 23 (financial resources). **Paragraph 26** (fora for forestry dialogue) was deleted.

OPEN-ENDED INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON FORESTS: There was a prolonged discussion on the two bracketed **paragraphs 3.V.2** on other arrangements for further implementation of the Forest Principles. The G-77/China removed brackets from the alternative paragraph, which calls on the Panel to advise on the need for other instruments, including appropriate legal arrangements. As a result, delegates deleted the brackets around the title of category V, which now reads: "International organizations and multilateral institutions and instruments, including appropriate legal mechanisms."

The EU and the US called for the deletion of **paragraph I.3**, since protection of traditional forest-related knowledge is being addressed elsewhere. The G-77/China and Canada wanted to retain the text. The final compromise text, proposed by Canada, states that consideration of this issue will be "consistent with the Convention on Biological Diversity." Reference to national law was deleted. Delegates agreed to the first option for **paragraph II** (improving the efficiency and coordination of bilateral and multilateral assistance), as amended by the UK and the G-77/China.

PROMOTING SUSTAINABLE AGRICULTURE AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Agreement was reached after a minor amendment to **paragraph 7** (environmental consequences), on social and economic conditions in developing countries.

ENVIRONMENTALLY SOUND MANAGEMENT OF BIOTECHNOLOGY: Agreement was reached after the G-77/China replaced a reference in **paragraph 5(e)** (biosafety) to "note" work on the development of guidelines on biosafety.

CONSERVATION OF BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY: There was a prolonged procedural debate about the status of **paragraphs 7** and the new **paragraph 9(j)** on the protection of traditional knowledge and practices. The latter was transferred from the chapter on financial resources. Some confusion resulted and the Chair said he would consult with Cavalcanti.

SUSTAINABLE MOUNTAIN DEVELOPMENT: Agreement was reached after brackets were removed from "protection" of indigenous people's interests.

THINGS TO LOOK FOR TODAY

HIGH-LEVEL SEGMENT: The High-Level Segment will continue this morning and this afternoon.

INFORMAL MEETING OF THE PLENARY: The Plenary will meet this morning in an informal session to consider outstanding decisions.

PANEL DISCUSSION ON THE MEDIA AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT: This evening's panel discussion will take place at 5:00 pm in Conference Room 1.