



CITES COP-12 HIGHLIGHTS: WEDNESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2002

Delegates met in Committee I to consider recommendations and resolutions, and amendments to the Appendices, while Committee II discussed, *inter alia*, resolution review, species trade and conservation issues, and personal effects. Both Committees considered outcomes from working groups.

COMMITTEE I

COOPERATION WITH CCAMLR: CHILE introduced its resolution on cooperation with the Commission for the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources (CCAMLR) regarding trade in Patagonian toothfish (Doc.16.1 and 16.1 Annex (Rev.1)). Parties highlighted CCAMLR's principal role in toothfish conservation. An amended resolution was adopted.

IPOA FOR SHARKS: AUSTRALIA introduced the draft resolution on the role of CITES in implementing the International Plan of Action for Conservation and Management of Sharks (IPOA-Sharks) (Doc.12.41.2 Addendum). JAPAN, NORWAY and ICELAND stated that FAO and regional fisheries organizations should deal with the IPOA and its implementation. The proposal was approved.

SYGNATHIDAE: Animals Committee Chair Hoogmoed introduced, and delegates adopted, the document on conservation of seahorses and other members of the family syngnathidae (Doc.43).

PROPOSALS TO AMEND THE APPENDICES: Basking Shark: The UK introduced an EU proposal to include *Cetorhinus maximus* in Appendix II (Prop. 12.36). TUNISIA and others supported the proposal, while NORWAY and others opposed, pointing to insufficient data, FAO's role in fishery management and identification problems. With 72 in favor, 38 against, and 2 abstentions, the proposal failed.

Seahorses: The US presented its proposal to include *Hippocampus* spp. in Appendix II (Prop.12.37). NEW ZEALAND, KENYA, the EU, PERU, and FIJI supported the proposal, while JAPAN, CHINA, MALAYSIA and the RUSSIAN FEDERATION opposed. The amended proposal was adopted through a roll-call vote with 75 in favor, 24 against and 19 abstentions.

Humphead Wrasse: The US introduced its proposal to include *Cheilinus undulatas* in Appendix II (Prop.12.38). MALAYSIA, the RUSSIAN FEDERATION and JAPAN opposed the proposal, stressing FAO's responsibility for marine species and insufficient data. With 65 in favor, 42 against, five abstentions, the proposal was rejected by secret ballot.

Patagonian Toothfish: In view of the resolution on cooperation with CCAMLR, AUSTRALIA withdrew its proposal to include *Dissostichus eleginoides* and *D. mawsonii* in Appendix II (Prop.12.39).

Swallowtail Butterflies: GERMANY withdrew its proposal to list *Papilio aristophontes*, *P. nireus*, and *P. sosia* in Appendix II (Prop.12.41).

Monkey Puzzle Tree: ARGENTINA introduced, and delegates adopted, its proposal to include *Araucaria araucana* in Appendix I (Prop.12.42).

Cactaceae: Delegates adopted SWITZERLAND's proposal to exempt artificially propagated specimens of color mutant forms of cacti that lack chlorophyll (Prop.12.43).

Prickly Pear and Leaf-Bearing Cacti: SWITZERLAND withdrew its proposals to delete *Opuntioideae* spp. (Prop.12.44), *Pereskioideae* spp. and *Quiabentia* spp. (Prop.12.45) from Appendix II.

Tonopah Fishhook Cactus: The US presented, and delegates adopted, its proposal to transfer *Sclerocactus nyensis* from Appendix II to I (Prop.12.46).

Blaine's Pincushion: The US withdrew its proposal to transfer *Sclerocactus spinosior* spp. *blainei* from Appendix II to I (Prop.12.47).

Bigleaf Mahogany: NICARAGUA and GUATEMALA introduced their proposal to include *Swietenia macrophylla* in Appendix II (Prop.12.50). In a secret ballot vote, the proposal was accepted with 68 in favor, 30 against and 14 abstentions.

Orchids: The US presented its proposal and amendment to annotate *Orchidaceae* in Appendix II to exclude artificially propagated specimens (Prop.12.51), restricting it to genera *Phalaenopsis*. With 48 in favor, 20 against and 45 abstentions, the proposal was accepted.

Desert-Living Cistanche: CHINA introduced its proposal to delete the current annotation to *Cistanche deserticola* in Appendix II (Prop.12.52). Delegates accepted the proposal by consensus and requested the Plants Committee to consider a more appropriate annotation.

Lignum-Vitae: GERMANY presented an EU proposal to include *Guaiaacum* spp. in Appendix II (Prop.12.54). The proposal was adopted by consensus.

Flat-Tailed Tortoise: Delegates adopted MADAGASCAR's proposal to transfer *Pyxis planicauda* from Appendix II to I (Prop.12.55).

Armored Chameleon: Delegates adopted MADAGASCAR's proposal to include *Brookesia peramata* in Appendix I (Prop.12.56).

Chameleons: MADAGASCAR introduced, and delegates adopted, its proposal to include all *Brookesia* spp. except *B. peramata* in Appendix II (Prop.12.57).

Burrowing Frogs: MADAGASCAR presented its proposal to include several *Scaphiophryne* spp. in Appendix II (Prop.12.58). The EU proposed, and the Committee agreed, that only *S. gottlebei* be listed.

Madagascan Orchid: MADAGASCAR introduced its proposal to transfer *Aerangis alata* from Appendix II to I (Prop.12.59). Delegates adopted the proposal.

This issue of the *Earth Negotiations Bulletin* © <enb@iisd.org> is written and edited by Karen Alvarenga <karen@iisd.org>, Prisma Nuengsigkapien <prisna@iisd.org>, Mark Schulman <mark@iisd.org>, Silke Speier <silkspeier@yahoo.com>, and Elsa Tsioumani <elsa@iisd.org>. The Digital Editor is David Fernau <david@iisd.org>. The Editor is Pamela S. Chasek, Ph.D. <pam@iisd.org> and the Director of IISD Reporting Services is Langston James "Kimo" Goree VI <kimo@iisd.org>. The Operations Manager is Marcela Rojo <marcela@iisd.org> and the On-Line Assistant is Diego Noguera <diego@iisd.org>. The Sustaining Donors of the *Bulletin* are The Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Government of Canada (through CIDA), the United States (through USAID), the Swiss Agency for Environment, Forests and Landscape (SAEFL), the United Kingdom (through the Department for International Development-DFID), the European Commission (DG-ENV), the Danish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and the Government of Germany (through the German Federal Ministry of Environment-BMU, and the German Federal Ministry of Development Cooperation-BMZ). General Support for the *Bulletin* during 2002 is provided by the Ministries of Foreign Affairs and Environment of Finland, the Government of Australia, the Ministry of Environment and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Sweden, the Ministry of Environment of Iceland, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade of New Zealand, the Ministries of Foreign Affairs and Environment of Norway, Swan International, the Japanese Ministry of Environment (through the Institute for Global Environmental Strategies-IGES) and the Japanese Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry (through the Global Industrial and Social Progress Research Institute-GISPRI). Funding for the ENB Spanish version is provided by the Spanish Climate Change Bureau. The *Bulletin* can be contacted by e-mail at <enb@iisd.org> and at tel: +1-212-644-0204; fax: +1-212-644-0206. IISD can be contacted by e-mail at <info@iisd.ca> and at 161 Portage Avenue East, 6th Floor, Winnipeg, Manitoba R3B 0Y4, Canada. The opinions expressed in the *Earth Negotiations Bulletin* are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of IISD and other funders. Excerpts from the *Earth Negotiations Bulletin* may be used in non-commercial publications only and only with appropriate academic citation. For permission to use this material in commercial publications, contact the Director of IISD Reporting Services. Electronic versions of the *Bulletin* are sent to e-mail distribution lists and can be found on the Linkages WWW server at <http://www.iisd.ca>. Satellite image provided by The Living Earth, Inc. <http://livingearth.com>. For information on the *Earth Negotiations Bulletin* or to arrange meeting coverage, conference or workshop, send e-mail to the Director, IISD Reporting Services at <kimo@iisd.org> or call to +1-212-644-0217.



WORKING GROUPS: Appendix II Export Quotas: The US presented the working group's draft decisions (Com.I.2) for Appendix II species export quotas (Doc. 49), noting support for the Secretariat's capacity-building programme. The draft decisions were adopted.

Registering Captive Breeding Operations: CHILE presented the working group's outcomes (Com.I.1) on operations that breed Appendix I species in captivity for commercial purposes (Doc.55.1 and 2). It recommended treating plants and animals separately and simplifying procedures to register breeding operations. Delegates agreed on the recommendations.

Criteria: IUCN presented the working group's outcomes, noting that it was unable to consider Doc.12.59. He outlined the Chair's text (Com.I.3) and introduced two draft resolutions on the proposed revision of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Com.I.4 and Com.I.5). CANADA and the Secretariat proposed separate amendments to Com.I.5, which outlined the terms of reference for a review process. Delegates adopted Com.I.3 and the amended Com.I.5.

Amendment of the Appendices with Regard to Populations: The Secretariat suggested that the document on this matter would be noted (Doc.12.59).

COMMITTEE II

TRADE IN BEARS: The Secretariat presented suggestions by the drafting group on trade in bear specimens (Doc.31), proposing a deadline extension for range and consumer States to submit reports on actions taken to implement Resolution Conf. 10.8. Delegates approved the draft decisions.

CETACEANS: JAPAN agreed to withdraw its proposals on controlled trade in specimens of abundant cetacean stocks (Doc.38), provided that Mexico withdraw its proposal on CITES-IWC cooperation (Doc.16.4). Both Parties agreed and the proposals were withdrawn.

RESOLUTION REVIEW: Permits and certificates: MEXICO reported on the draft resolution (Com.II.4), suggesting modifications on, *inter alia*: pre-Convention specimens; import permits; certificate of origins; traveling exhibition certificates; and information to be included in CITES permits and certificates. Delegates accepted the document as amended.

LIVE-ANIMAL EXHIBITIONS: The RUSSIAN FEDERATION withdrew its proposal on traveling live-animal exhibitions (Doc.57).

PERSONAL EFFECTS: CHINA presented the working group's draft resolution on personal effects (Com.II.6). The Committee requested the Secretariat to develop a process for exempting personal and household effects of Appendix II species. The draft resolution was approved as amended, with VENEZUELA withdrawing its proposal on personal effects made of crocodilian leather (Doc.54.2).

STURGEONS: The Secretariat introduced its proposal on the conservation of sturgeons (Doc.42.1). IRAN supported and KAZAKHSTAN, the RUSSIAN FEDERATION and the US made reservations to the proposal. Delegates accepted the report as a recommendation rather than a decision.

The Secretariat then introduced the draft resolutions (Doc.42.2). Regarding shared stocks' catch and export quotas, IRAN opposed allowing the Secretariat to decide whether the quotas are sustainable, and the Committee deleted the reference. IRAN also suggested that domestic quota reductions of a range State should not affect the quotas of other range States of a shared stock. Regarding caviar labeling, the US suggested, and the Committee rejected, amendments to limit labeling requirements to international trade. The draft resolutions were approved as amended. Delegates also accepted the draft decisions.

ASIAN BIG CAT SPECIES: INDIA presented its amended proposal on conservation of and trade in tigers and other Appendix I Asian big cat species (Doc.32 (Rev.1) Annex 1 and 2). Delegates accepted the draft resolution, with an amendment suggested by the US. CHINA recorded its opposition.

TIGERS: The Committee adopted the document on conservation of and trade in tigers (Doc.33) with a correction regarding Myanmar's situation.

TIBETAN ANTELOPE: Delegates addressed a draft decision directing the Secretariat to undertake an enforcement needs' assessment mission to China to provide technical assistance regarding anti-poaching and wool smuggling. The document was approved.

MAHOGANY: The Secretariat presented the report of the Mahogany Working Group (Doc.47). Delegates adopted the report, deciding to maintain the working group, subject to external funds, and amendment of its term of reference in light of Committee I's uplisting to Appendix II.

EXPORT QUOTAS: GERMANY introduced its proposal on improving the management of annual export quotas and amendment of Resolution Conf. 10.2 (Rev.) Annex 1 on permits and certificates (Doc.50.1). The RUSSIAN FEDERATION suggested amendments. SAINT LUCIA and JAMAICA noted small countries' difficulties in implementing the proposal. Discussion will resume.

The US presented its proposal and amendments on implementation and monitoring of nationally established export quotas for species listed in Appendix II (Doc.50.2). Delegates adopted the amended draft decision that will be forwarded to the Standing Committee.

TRADE IN TIME-SENSITIVE BIOLOGICAL SAMPLES: The Secretariat presented its proposal (Doc.51) and noted the draft resolution on a simplified procedure could be extended for other non-biological samples. Delegates accepted the proposal.

CITES AND MARINE SPECIES: CHILE introduced its proposal and amendments on establishing a working group to analyze relevant aspects of CITES application to marine species (Doc.61). NORWAY made a procedural motion to defer discussion to COP-13 and delegates voted against it. In a secret ballot vote requested by JAPAN, delegates rejected the proposal, with 40 in favor, 25 against and 6 abstentions.

BUSHMEAT: The Secretariat introduced the proposal on bushmeat (Doc.62) and recommended maintaining the Bushmeat Working Group. The EU suggested inserting reference to synergies with the CBD. Delegates adopted the amended draft decision.

CERTIFICATES FOR MOVEMENTS OF SAMPLE COLLECTIONS: ITALY introduced an EU proposal (Doc.52.2). Following a US suggestion, the Committee decided to direct the Standing Committee to examine the procedure to enable CITES certificates to become an annex to international customs documents.

TRADE IN TIMBER SPECIES: The Committee supported the suggested deletion of Decision 11.155 on the potential of silvicultural techniques (Doc.53) for establishing trade regimes for listed timber species.

NON-COMMERCIAL LOAN OF SPECIMENS: The US presented the document on non-commercial loan, donation or exchange of museum and herbarium specimens (Doc.56). She amended Resolution Conf.11.15 to encourage registration of scientific institutions. BRAZIL said the issue should be dealt with in the CBD. Discussion will resume.

ANNOTATIONS FOR MEDICINAL PLANTS: The Committee agreed to update Decision 11.118 on the issue directed to the Plants Committee.

RESCUE OF DEPENDENT APES FROM WAR ZONES: KENYA introduced its proposal (Doc.63) and discussion was postponed.

IN THE CORRIDORS

Discussions on proposals to amend Appendices shifted from the savanna to the sea with delegates deliberating on sharks, seahorses, humphead wrasse and the Patagonian toothfish proposals. Whether rejecting or accepting the proposals, many delegates were pleased with what they saw as an increased focus on marine species, something CITES has traditionally shied away from. The same trend holds true for timber, with the acceptance of bigleaf mahogany in Appendix II. Several delegates saw the listing as one of the more successful CITES outcomes. According to others, the success may be short-lived as this decision, and several others, may be revisited and perhaps reversed in Plenary.

THINGS TO LOOK FOR TODAY

PLENARY: Plenary will be at 10:00 am and at 2:00 pm in Conference Room 1

COMMITTEE II: Committee II will meet at 9:00 am in Conference Room 2 to consider outstanding issues.